

To the Accreditation Council of the  
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare  
December 18, 2023

**REPORT  
OF AN EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF  
EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM 7R01112  
“PATHOLOGICAL ANATOMY” OF THE CORPORATE FOUNDATION  
“UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER” FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE  
STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION  
PROGRAMS (RESIDENCE SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL  
ORGANIZATIONS**

**External expert evaluation period: November 27-29, 2023**

**Astana, 2023**

## CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	6
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01112 "Pathological Anatomy"	6
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	10
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on self-assessment of the educational program in the specialty 7R01112 "Pathological Anatomy"	10
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	12
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01112 "Pathological Anatomy"	18
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational program of residency in specialty 7R01112 "Pathological Anatomy"	47
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	47
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational program of residency in the specialty of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" and educational program of residency in specialty 7R01112 "Pathological Anatomy"	48
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	49

**LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:**

<b>Abbreviation</b>	<b>Designation</b>
AMP	administrative and management personnel
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standard
Department	Department of Science and Education of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre"
End-of-course assessment	End-of-course assessment
IEP	Individual education plan
RW	Research work
CF "UMC"	corporate foundation "University Medical Centre"
CED	catalog of elective disciplines
MOH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO	Medical educational organization
MES RK	Ministry of Higher Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTB	material and technical base
R&D works	research&development works
NSCMC	National Scientific Centre for Motherhood and Childhood
PE	postgraduate education
CDP	Continuous professional development
RT	retraining
Academic staff	academic staff
EP	educational programs
RDC	Republican Diagnostic Center
WC	working curriculum
NCIE	national center of independent examination
QMS	Quality Management System
IWRT	work of a resident doctor under the supervision of a clinical mentor during the clinical activity of the resident doctor
IWR	independent work of a resident doctor
EMC	educational and methodological council
EMCD	educational and methodological complexes of disciplines
GPA	Grade Point Average - the arithmetic average of the grades received for all completed courses, taking into account the time spent on them
JCI	Joint Commission International
UPMC	University of Pittsburgh Medical Center
NUSM	Nazarbayev University School of Medicine

### 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 26 dated November 8, 2023, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational program in the specialty 7R01112 - "Pathological Anatomy" during the period December 27-29, 2023, in the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	TURGUNOV YERMEK MEIRAMOVICH,	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President NJCS "Surgical Association of the Karaganda Region", member of the International Surgery Society, member of the "Astana Association of Independent Experts" and the "Union of Independent Experts of KSMU"
2	International expert	ZIGANSHINA LILIYA YEVGENIEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Epidemiology of the Russian Medical Academy of Continuing Professional Education, Director of Cochrane Russia  Member of the WHO Committee on the Selection and Use of Essential Medicines. Laureate of the State Prize of the Republic of Tatarstan in the field of science and technology for the work "Development and implementation in healthcare practice of the Republic of Tatarstan of a new technology for the selection and rational use of drugs - the formulary system."
3	International expert	SAATOVA GULI MIRAKHMATOVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Cardio and Rheumatology of the Institution "National Centre for Maternal and Child Health" of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic (MHKR), Chief Rheumatologist of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Vice-President of the Association of Rheumatologists of Central Asia and Kazakhstan
4	Academic expert	ZHANTELIEVA LYAZZAT ASANOVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Research JSC Scientific Centre of Urology named

			after. B.U.Dzharbusynov"
5	Academic expert	MADIAROV VALENTIN MANARBEKOVICH	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a course of anaesthesiology and resuscitation of the National Educational Institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
6	Academic expert	IDRISOV ALISHER SAUGABAEVICH	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Family Medicine No. 2 NJSC "Astana Medical University"
7	Academic expert	RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN KHAMZAEVN	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Childhood Diseases named after N.A. Barlybaeva NJSC Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
8	Academic expert	DOLMATOVA IRINA ANATOLYEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, acting Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
9	Academic expert	ARINOVA SAULE PASEVNOEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"
10	Academic expert	KARIBAEVA DINA ORYNBASAROVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department fundamental medicine Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi
11	Academic expert	<b>APBASOVA SAULESH AKHATOVNA</b>	<b>Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assistant at the Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine named after Professor Yu.V. Pruglo NJSC "Semey Medical University"</b>
12	Academic expert	MENCHISHEVA YULIA ALEKSANDROVNA	PhD in Medicine, Head of Department surgical dentistry NJSC "Kazakh national medical university named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
13	Resident expert	YERKINOV YERBOLAT	first year resident in specialty "Angiosurgery, including children's" LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre". Resident of the surgical community "Veritas" NJSC "Astana Medical University"
14	Resident expert	ORYNBAY AYZERE SOULETKYZY	2nd year resident of specialty "General Surgery"

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01112 "Pathological Anatomy" of the CF "UMC" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational institutions and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for implementation the above-mentioned educational program and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report of the EEC

### 2.1 Presentation of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" (CF "UMC") and the educational residency program in specialty 7R01112 "Pathological Anatomy"

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre", BIN 151 040 018 391
Management Body	Governing body
Full name of the first manager	Pya Yuri Vladimirovich
Date of creation	2015
Location and contact details	Astana, st. Kerey and Zhanibek khandary, 5/1, 8 (7172) 69-26-39, <a href="mailto:Madina.Agdarbekova@umc.org.kz">Madina.Agdarbekova@umc.org.kz</a> 8 (7172) 69-25-26, <a href="mailto:a.muftalova@umc.org.kz">a.muftalova@umc.org.kz</a> 8 (7172) 69-25-13, <a href="mailto:kerimkulova.aigerim@umc.org.kz">kerimkulova.aigerim@umc.org.kz</a>
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	Conducting educational programs without a license for educational activities, on the basis of the Law "On the status of "Nazarbayev University", "Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools" and "Nazarbayev Foundation"
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	Shymkent Heart Center
Year of commencement of the accredited educational program (EP)	Pathological Anatomy – 2021
Duration of training	Pathological anatomy – 2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	Pathological anatomy – 1 graduate
Number of residents in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	Pathological anatomy – 3 residents

The Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" (hereinafter - CF "UMC") was created in accordance with the decision of the Board of Trustees of the Autonomous Educational Organization "Nazarbayev University" (hereinafter - Nazarbayev University) dated September 20, 2015 No. 20 on the basis of subsidiaries of the joint stock company "National medical holding" (<https://umc.org.kz/about-umc/>).

CF "UMC", with a total capacity of 475 inpatient beds and 500 outpatient visits per shift, combines two innovative medical canterers: the Diagnostic Centre, the Centre for Maternity and Childhood.

CF "UMC" unites two leading medical canterers, including the National Scientific Centre for Maternity and Childhood (hereinafter referred to as NSCMC), the Republican Diagnostic Centre (hereinafter referred to as RDC), and a branch in Kyzylorda. Also, on the basis of Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 822 dated September 21, 2023, the non-profit joint

stock company “Shymkent Heart Centre” was transferred from the municipal property of the city of Shymkent to the ownership of Nazarbayev University. Two centres of the CF "UMC" (NSCMC, RDC) have passed international accreditation by Joint Commission International, which is a guarantee of the safety of the services provided and confirmation of the provision of medical services in accordance with the level of the international standard. In 2021, CF “UMC” again confirmed its compliance with international standards and successfully passed the JCI re-accreditation procedure as a single clinic. Information about the UMC Foundation is available on the official website, including in the “Accreditation” section, at the link: <https://umc.org.kz/about-umc/>.

Activity as part of the integrated academic health care system of Nazarbayev University ensures the uniqueness of the educational services offered. As part of the integrated academic health care system of Nazarbayev University, CF “UMC” attracts foreign specialists “mentors” and organizes master classes with the participation of international experts on the basis of its centres to create a competitive generation of medical personnel, develop and adapt modern protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of diseases, as well as improving the quality of medical care.

CF "UMC" pays special attention to the issue of compliance with the requirements of international standards of quality and safety of medical care JCI, including through the use of methodologies for continuous quality improvement, advanced training of medical personnel in leading medical organizations in the world, the introduction of a patient-oriented system of medical care, including based on the recommendations of partner mentors from Switzerland in the field of hospital services.

In accordance with the Charter of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Governing Council of Nazarbayev University dated October 16, 2015 No. 16.10.15 (with amendments and additions approved by the decision of the Governing Council of Nazarbayev University dated February 6, 2018 No. 06.02.18), one of the main type of activity of CF "UMC" is educational. Corporate documents, including the Charter of CF "UMC" are available on the website at the link: <https://umc.org.kz/documents/>.

The organizational, functional and staffing structures of the organization are built taking into account the mission, goals, objectives and policies in the field of quality assurance.

The organizational structure of CF "UMC" was developed on the basis of strategic directions approved by the governing body of CF "UMC", the vertical subordination of the relevant structural divisions to the Deputy Chairman of the Board, Medical and Executive Directors in the areas supervised. The basis for constructing the organizational system of the centres of the CF "UMC" is the main process blocks: medical, strategic, nursing and service and economic.

Residency training at CF “UMC” has been carried out since 2016. According to Article 8 of the Law “On the status of “Nazarbayev University”, “Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools”, and “Nazarbayev Foundation”, Nazarbayev University, Intellectual Schools, and their organizations carry out educational activities without a license, without state certification.

Residency programs are implemented in accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6. The list of residency programs implemented by the Department of Education of the UMC is presented on the platform of the CF "UMC" as follows link: <https://umc.org.kz/?residency=post>.

The total number of students in the 2022-2023 academic years was 132 resident doctors. In 2023, 39 people graduated, the number of students admitted to residency for the 2023-2024 academic year was 87 people.

The lecturers are highly qualified specialists, doctors and candidates of medical sciences, doctors of the highest category with experience in clinical work and teaching, trained in the best centres and clinics in the world. The total number of teachers involved in the educational process of residency and additional professional training is 206 people, of which 27 are Doctor of Medical Sciences, Ph.D. – 60. The number of teaching staff in the residency program “Pathological

Anatomy” is 3 people, all of them with the highest medical category. The academic staff in the residency specialties of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" is available for viewing at the following link: [https://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/PPS\\_list.pdf](https://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/PPS_list.pdf).

Since the beginning of 2016, more than 100 specialists from the clinics of the CF “UMC” have been sent to leading foreign centres, which have mastered and are successfully implementing the latest diagnostic and treatment technologies in the field of paediatric traumatology, oncohematology, transplantation, obstetrics and gynaecology, paediatric rehabilitation, haematology, etc. The training was carried out on the basis of leading clinics in Israel, France, Lithuania, Japan, Switzerland, Singapore, Germany, and Russia.

In addition, to master practical skills in advanced medical technologies, master classes are held and mentoring programs are implemented at the clinics of the CF “UMC” with the involvement of qualified specialists from leading foreign organizations.

In September 2015, by the decision of the Board of Trustees of Nazarbayev University (Minutes No. 20 of September 20, 2015), the CF “UMC” was created. By the decision of the Governing Council of AEO Nazarbayev University dated October 16, 2015, the Charter of the CF “UMC” was approved. By decision of the Board of Trustees of CF "UMC" dated May 25, 2019 No. 25.05.19, the Development Strategy of CF "UMC" for 2019-2023 was approved. An operational plan for the implementation of this strategy was developed and approved by the Board of CF "UMC" (with the latest changes by the decision of the Board dated 16 February 2023 No. 3).

Since 2016, the process of transforming the School of Medicine of Nazarbayev University and the UMC CF into an academic medical centre began. A Joint Steering Committee was created, which consists of the executive management of Nazarbayev University, UPMC (strategic partner University of Pittsburgh Medical Centre), and EMC. Regular meetings of the Joint Steering Committee were held to make decisions on integration issues with the participation of NUSM, CF "UMC", NLA (National Laboratory Astana - a structure of Nazarbayev University), UPMC.

In addition, an agreement is annually concluded between NU and UPMC to provide advisory and technical support to the latter for the further development of an integrated academic healthcare system based on NU structures (NUSM, CF "UMC", and NLA). Together with UPMC, a plan was prepared with recommendations on relationships, management, organizational structure, administrative functions and processes, roles and responsibilities of NU and CF "UMC".

CF “UMC” worked to become the official representative of the European Resuscitation Centre (ERC) in the Central Asian region. A Centre of Excellence in the field of training, research and innovation in the field of emergency situations has been created on the basis of the CF "UMC". The Centre will train citizens and healthcare professionals in critical technical skills and knowledge in critical care through ERC-accredited programs. A total of 19 certified instructors were trained.

Since 2019, as part of the development of the system of additional and non-formal education of the CF "UMC":

1) The methodology of distance learning was introduced (the format and content of educational programs were developed depending on the needs of practical healthcare; the academic staff of the CF "UMC" was trained in the use of distance technologies; access to Moodle was provided outside of the workplace; the recording of student data was automated training cycles).

2) A system of vocational education has been formed for employees of the CF “UMC” through training cycles depending on the need. Thus, during the reporting period, 45 employees were trained and involved in teaching activities on the topic “Methodology of medical education and science.” Also, 266 specialists from the CF “UMC” were trained in various clinical areas.

3) Work continues on the transfer of new methods of diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation to the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Thus, over the years 2019 -2023, teachers of the CF “UMC” trained more than 4,500 students of advanced training cycles from the regions. Within the framework of the 005 republican budget program, 340 specialists from healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan were trained.



## **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

EP 7R01112 – “Pathological anatomy” was developed and entered into the Register of educational programs of higher and postgraduate education in 2021. Accreditation of the residency educational program 7R01112 – “Pathological Anatomy” is being carried out for the first time.

## **2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the residency educational program in the specialty “7R01112 – “Pathological Anatomy”**

The self-assessment report of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01112 – “Pathological Anatomy” (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 203 pages of main text, 53 pages of appendices, copies or electronic versions of documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14S5rlRqW1y6YisriMINLOmtjOMFW3Nj?usp=sharing>

, [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1VnNmI-pZJkoP16pgiHjoggnslA\\_kePco?usp=sharing](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1VnNmI-pZJkoP16pgiHjoggnslA_kePco?usp=sharing) , [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1zyX\\_ybBPx8E-z\\_z-Wyj391J1o2OnMX1x?usp=sharing](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1zyX_ybBPx8E-z_z-Wyj391J1o2OnMX1x?usp=sharing)

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the Deputy Chairman of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" Nurgul Kalieva Khamzina, who confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 25 members of the internal self-assessment committee.

Self-assessment of the residency educational program 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy” was carried out on the basis of order No. 08-n/k dated June 1, 2023 “On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for specialized accreditation of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre”.

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: \_candidate of medical sciences, Apbasova S.A., and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback with a representative of the university and the corresponding changes and additions were made according to the self-assessment.

All standards contain the actual practice of the University in training residents in the specialty “7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy””, taking into account the start of admission of students in 2023, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards . The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated regarding the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, results of evaluation of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the university and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, database), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is presented to the ECAQA in complete form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain references in the text and are continuously numbered.

## **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy” was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting

external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of ECAQA / Dates of visit to the organization: November 27-29, 2023. Sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in Annex 3 to this report

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 46 people
- interviews with residents – 50 people, including 3 residents in specialty 7R01112 – “Pathological anatomy”
- study of the website <https://umc.org.kz/?residency=post;>
- interviewing 38 employees, 38 teachers, 36 mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents - 32 and 80, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attending a practical lesson with 1-year residents, topic was “Childhood Tumours”, teacher was Lee V.E., venue was CF “UMS”
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: visited the pathology departments of the National Scientific Centre for Maternity and Childhood, the Republican Diagnostic Centre and the Nazarbayev University School of Medicine, practice bases/clinical engagement, where training is conducted in 9 educational programs with the participation of 117 full-time teachers/part-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 16 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, talks with members of the EEC**

<b>№</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
1	Management and administrative staff	7
2	Directors of clinical and academic departments	8
3	Teachers for residency specialties	39
4	Students of additional and non-formal education programs	7
5	Residents of different years of study (1-3 years)	96
6	Graduates of residency programs	8
7	Representatives of support services (human resources, financial sector)	9

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion was held on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, talks and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational program 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.” No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed and the chairman, Prof. Turgunov E.M., held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council/

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the University, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

*When conducting a survey of residents, the majority of respondents (73.75%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs.*

*According to 81.25% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.*

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

#### **4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy”**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

###### **1.1 Mission and outcome statement**

When implementing the activities of the visit program, namely, based on the results of interviews with the leaders of the organization, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, and the mission was communicated to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. Taking into account the data of the internal and external environment identified in the process of analysing the current situation, the priority **strategic direction** of CF "UMC" is to become a centre of advanced knowledge and experience, which requires a successful synergy of research, educational and clinical activities. You can get acquainted with the Strategic Plan of the CF "UMC" for 2019-2023 using the following source: [https://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/strategicheskij-plan\\_umc\\_na-2019-2023\\_gg.-rus.pdf](https://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/strategicheskij-plan_umc_na-2019-2023_gg.-rus.pdf) The organization's strategic plan for 3 years has been reviewed, confirming the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases. The university has all the resources necessary to develop professional qualities and achieve the final results stated in the mission of the educational program in accordance with national and international requirements and needs of the healthcare sector. The mission of CF "UMC" is reflected in the strategic plan of CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of Trustees of CF "UMC" dated May 25, 2019 No. 25.05.19. All structural divisions of CF "UMC" took part in the development of the strategy and mission; discussions also took place at the level of consultative and advisory bodies, incl. at the educational and methodological council of May 8, 2019 No. 3.

The educational program in the specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy” was developed in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard for the 22nd year of residency in medical specialties, a standard professional curriculum for medical specialties of residency (Annex 2). The educational program for the first year of residents entering in 2022 was developed collectively. The mission and vision of the CF "UMC" are available for review by employees, resident doctors, students, patients and other interested parties by posting on the CF "UMC" website ([www.umc.org.kz](http://www.umc.org.kz) – Home page - About the Foundation - About us).

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy” and the educational process are built in accordance with State Compulsory Educational Standards -22 and current Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and healthcare.

###### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

A visit to the clinical site, attending open classes, meetings with teachers and residents made it possible to see that by adhering to a patient-centred approach in the clinical process, while maintaining the need for assistance, each resident develops an individual level of such quality as professionalism. The formation of professionalism is based on direct training in the workplace, where residents are faced with clinical situations of pathological diagnosis of surgical and biopsy and cadaveric materials, practice at various levels of complexity, adopting the experience of senior colleagues, and thereby building their own model of behaviours.

Based on the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which enshrines the autonomy of organizations of higher and postgraduate education, which gives the right, on the basis of standard rules, State Compulsory Educational Standards 2022, the University independently determines the development of an educational program, evaluation, selection and admission of residents, selection/choice of teachers, employment conditions and resource distribution. Freedom in compiling EP was achieved in the compilation of syllabuses, CED, IEP, WC, the form, structure and procedure for development of which are determined by the organization independently. All educational and methodological documentation is reviewed and approved at meetings of the CEP, Academic and Academic Councils.

*80 residents participated in the survey. Of these, 43.75% are first-year residents, 43.75% are 2nd-year residents, and 12.5% are 3rd-year residents. According to the results of the survey (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>) 78.75% of respondents completely agree that they would recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives, 16.25% partially agree, and completely disagree 1.25% with this statement, 3.75% doubt the answer.*

*67.5% of residents strongly agreed with the statement that program directors and teachers are aware of residents' problems related to training, 23.75% partially agreed, and 7.5% completely disagreed with this statement.*

*According to the survey results, 66.25% of respondents believe that program directors and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational program committees), 6.25% answered that no, they do not involve, while 17.5% do not know about this, 7.5% are unsure about the answer, and 2.5% expressed the opinion that they are sometimes involved in this work.*

*71.25% of residents are completely satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms and classrooms of this educational organization, 23.75% are partially satisfied, and 1.25% is completely dissatisfied.*

*32 teachers surveyed, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 21.88%, from 5 to 10 years - 9.38%, over 10 years - 68.75%. Among teaching staff, residencies accounted for 78,13%.*

*96.88% were completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, 3.13% were partially satisfied. 81.25% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace, 15.63% are partially satisfied. The organization has opportunities for career growth and development of competence for teachers: 81.25% completely agree, 18.75% partially agree.*

### **1.3 Final learning outcomes**

In the EP residency in the specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy”, developed on the basis of the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. KR MOH-63 dated July 4, 2022 “On approval of state mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare”, which takes into account the main final results of training resident

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The experts were convinced that the professional behaviour and communication skills of residents are formed by achieving final results and are reflected in the relevant document - Code of Business Ethics of the CF “UMC” No. 17 dated December 26, 2022. Faculty and residents are informed about the code of ethics. You can familiarize yourself

with the contents of the code of ethics on the website, which serves as the basis for the formation of proper morality in the team, respectful attitude among themselves and towards patients.

When determining the final learning outcomes, employees of the Department of Education took into account previous learning outcomes in undergraduate and internship programs, and also took into account the goals and objectives of subsequent continuous professional development in the chosen specialty. The educational organization provides training in additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development), including programs in the specialty of an accredited educational program.

Unanimously, 100% of the teacher respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program.

*The surveyed teachers responded that 68.75% were completely satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 28.13% were partially satisfied.*

*Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The organization has developed 21 continuing education programs, including for the specialty “7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy”.” Residents are informed about this.*

#### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final results**

In developing the goals and objectives of the educational program “Pathological Anatomy”, all structural divisions of the CF “UMC” took part, which is confirmed by document approved by the educational and methodological council dated May 8, 2019 No. 3.

When talking with residents and employers, experts, a clear answer was received to the question “Are you involved in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program?” In response to these questions, residents of the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” noted that they are members of collegial bodies, where they have the opportunity to express their opinions and put forward any ideas.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 14.

**Recommendations for improvement: No**

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program**

CF “UMC” operates on the basis of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 19, 2011 No. 394-IV “On the status of Nazarbayev University, Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools and Nazarbayev Foundation.” The consistency and transparency of training is guaranteed by the fact that the CF “UMC” operates on the basis of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 19, 2011 No. 394-IV “On the status of Nazarbayev University, Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools and the Nazarbayev Foundation.”

Educational activities in residency are carried out using credit technology in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 “On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process using credit technology of education.”

To implement the educational program in the specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy”, the organization’s documents contain EMCD, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with state standards and standard requirements has been established. The residency educational program is aimed at mastering theoretical and practical skills in accordance with the established final learning outcomes in terms of qualifications of graduates of PE programs.

The rules of residency training at the CF "UMC" guarantee objectivity, transparency and equality for all students.

Academic Policy and during interviews, residents responded that they were aware of the contents of this document.



An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom. Residency training is carried out taking into account the principles of continuity of basic medical education, postgraduate and continuous medical education throughout professional life.

In the educational program of residency in specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy”, continuity of education is observed based on the established final learning outcomes in undergraduate and internship courses. Transparency of the resident training process, including methods, teaching and assessment tools, is implemented through information on the university website. Residency training includes classroom work, independent clinical work under the guidance of a mentor, and the student’s own independent work (IWS). The volume of classroom work is 10% of the volume of each discipline, independent clinical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor - 75%, IWS - 15%. The volume of theoretical training is no more than 20% of the volume of the curriculum.

In accordance with the 2022 State Compulsory Educational Standard, the curriculum maintains the ratio of the volume of disciplines depending on the duration of study, 2-4 years. The full academic load of one academic year corresponds to at least 70 academic credits (2100 academic hours) for one academic year. One academic credit is equal to 30 academic hours. The academic year in residency consists of one academic period, annual certification, vacations and in the final year – end-of-course assessment.

The workload in the curriculum for the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” in accordance with the training period of 2 years:

- the cycle of major disciplines is presented in the amount of 4140 academic hours or 138 credits, including:
- mandatory component – 4020 ac. hours or 134 credits;
- optional component – 120 ac. hours or 4 credits.

Based on the State Educational Standard for all disciplines of the specialty, educational and methodological complexes of disciplines (EMCD) have been developed, including: academic calendars, working curricula, individual curricula, catalogue of elective disciplines, working curricula, syllabuses; control and measuring equipment. The educational and methodological complex of the discipline is adapted to the model of medical education and the credit education system, discussed and approved at the EMC. Syllabuses, a catalogue of elective disciplines, schedules and other information for each specialty area are posted on the website of the Faculty of Culture "UMC" (<http://umc.org.kz/about/science/rezidentura>).

The mentoring system, which is described in the document “Regulations on Clinical Mentoring,” was assessed. The tasks of the mentors are to assist the resident in mastering and improving the necessary clinical skills - “on-the-job training”. 85% of respondents noted that they were satisfied with the activities of mentors, 6.25% were not satisfied.

When planning the volume of educational work, it is assumed that one credit is equal to 15 academic hours of classroom work, including theoretical and practical training under the supervision of a teacher/clinical mentor: lectures, seminars, journal club, grand round, work of a resident doctor with a scientific supervisor on RW; discussion of a clinical case, simulation training, student work on preparing and passing the end-of-course assessment.

The extracurricular work of a resident doctor is supervised by a clinical mentor and includes: pathological diagnostics of biopsy, surgical and cadaveric materials, maintaining accounting and reporting documentation; participation in clinical and anatomical conferences, consultations, etc.

In the course of independent work, the resident doctor masters and consolidates knowledge of theoretical material in a practical way (autopsy, microscopic examination of surgical and biopsy materials, mastering practical skills, working in various departments of medical organizations, etc.); applies acquired knowledge and practical skills to analyse the situation and develop the right solution; applies acquired knowledge and skills when writing RW.

In order to inform students about all organizational and structural aspects of the educational process, resident doctors of the CF "UMC" are provided with a guidebook from 2022, which informs about the duties, rights and responsibilities of a resident doctor (<https://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2023/10/spravochnik-putivoditel-2023-4.pdf>). At CF "UMC", all students enjoy equal rights and perform equal responsibilities, unless otherwise provided by current legislation, the Charter, internal documents of CF "UMC" and agreements concluded with students on the provision of educational services.

Students of the CF "UMC" include all persons enrolled in the prescribed manner as resident doctors, persons carrying out advanced training and retraining in the educational programs of the CF "UMC".

Everyone is accepted into the residency of the CF "UMC", regardless of age, gender or nationality.

The average age of a student at the CF "UMC" residency is 25-30 years. Most people enter residency immediately after completing their internship. However, there are also those who enter after several years of practice to receive more in-depth medical education in a clinical specialty.

According to the Code of Business Ethics of the CF "UMC", approved by the protocol of the Board of the CF "UMC", No. 17 dated December 26, 2022, the CF "UMC" does not allow the establishment of any direct or indirect restrictions depending on gender, race, nationality, language, social origin, property status, place of residence, attitude to religion, beliefs, membership in public associations and any other circumstances. The fundamental corporate values on which the activities of CF "UMC" are formed are: reliability and professionalism, decency, labour efficiency, mutual respect.

The team of CF "UMC" is multinational. According to the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 11, 2011 No. 483-IV "On religious activities and religious associations" (with amendments and additions as of September 3, 2023), the CF "UMC" adopted a policy of freedom of spiritual belief. Attitude to religion is a purely personal matter and is not persecuted. No religious propaganda is carried out within the walls of the CF "UMC".

Teachers use methods of teaching residents such as lectures, oral surveys, case discussions, test control and other methods. The list of teaching methods is described in the self-assessment. Thanks to these methods, residents can participate in the pathological diagnosis of cadaveric, surgical and biopsy materials. Faculty can provide a resident with supervision of approximately 10 thematic surgical and biopsy materials per day and 200 per month. For example, residents of an educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" upon completion of training can carry out such manipulations as autopsy of a corpse, macro and microscopic diagnosis of cadaveric, surgical and biopsy materials, comparison of clinical and pathological diagnoses, establishment of categories of discrepancies in diagnoses, registration of a death certificate, etc.

Experts have found that the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism are fully implemented in educational organizations. Academic integrity applies to areas of resident education such as summative and formative evaluations. And anti-plagiarism is applicable when residents are engaged in research work.

Thus, by the end of the 2-year training, residents will acquire basic skills in the profession and are awarded the qualification of a doctor in the relevant specialty in accordance with the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of healthcare, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions for healthcare workers, approved by the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on December 21, 2020 No. KR MOH-305/2020, and a state-issued document is issued - a certificate of completion of residency, which will allow you to work in institutions such as the Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area (ESG 1.2).

The experts did not establish any violations with respect to the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuous professional development, since the educational organization complies with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law on the

Languages of the Peoples of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other LSI in the field of education and healthcare.

## **2.2 Scientific method**

CF “UMC” is accredited as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activities for 5 years (Certificate series MK-000058 dated 03/09/2021). Employees of the CF "UMC" participate in the implementation of scientific and technical projects, involving resident doctors in scientific activities. The list of security documents received by employees of the CF "UMC" for 2023 is posted on the CF "UMC" website: [http://umc.org.kz/?science=post#science\\_results](http://umc.org.kz/?science=post#science_results). List of scientific projects of the CF "UMC" for 2019-2023 is posted on the website of the CF "UMC": <http://umc.org.kz/?science=post#projects>. The list of publications by CF “UMC” employees for 2019-2022 is posted on the website: <http://umc.org.kz/?publications=post>.

At CF "UMC", the achievements of medical science are introduced into healthcare practice and into the educational process on modern methods of prevention, diagnosis and treatment of diseases. Resident doctors participate in conferences at the republican and international level and make presentations on specialized specialties. The list of resident doctors and the names of conferences are indicated in the Annex to the standard. During residency training, resident doctors, under the guidance of scientific supervisors, from among the graduated, highly qualified specialists of the CF “UMC”, conduct research work with subsequent publications and presentations at the UMC. Thus, in June 2022, at the meeting of the EMC, 14 research works of the 2022 residency graduates were approved (Minutes of the EMC dated 06/09/2022 No. 6). The results of 39 research works of graduates of 2023 were heard at the EMC from 06/01/2023 No. 9, from 06/08/2023 No. 12, from 06/06/2023 No. 10, from 06/07/2023 No. 11. Topics of research works of residency graduates, date of defence, scientific supervisors are specified in the Annex to the Standard.

To improve scientific and clinical activities and exchange experience, academic staff of the CF "UMC" participate in conferences, congresses, seminars, symposiums, meetings and forums held in the Republic of Kazakhstan, in near and far abroad countries, after which various implementation activities are carried out best practices in the educational process. To develop students' skills and knowledge in the critical assessment of literature, articles and scientific data, the CF "UMC" regularly holds journal club meetings in Russian and English in order to familiarize the medical staff and students of the CF "UMC" and its centres with advanced scientific literature in the area of research of interest, learning to critically evaluate the latest scientific publications in medicine in order to improve the treatment, diagnostic and educational processes.

The latest publications of scientific, educational and practical interest in the relevant field of research are subject to consideration at the journal club. The regulations on the Journal Club were approved at the EMC meeting on April 28, 2018 by protocol No. 2.

During interviews with residents, residents of specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy” noted their active participation in scientific work with department staff and carry out research work directly with clinical mentors. *When surveying residents, it was established that the educational organization has access to students’ participation in research work. 62.5% of residents claim that they are engaged in research work at the CF “UMC”, 18.75% have started planning research work, 12.5% have not decided on the topic of research work, 2.5% noted that teaching staff do not offer them to engage in research work, and 3.75% have no desire to engage in research at all.*

## **2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program**

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including State Compulsory Educational Standards 2022, EP in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy”, developed on the basis of State Compulsory Educational Standards -22 years. Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process is the teacher.



The content of work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, as well as the specifics of research work and the scientific achievements of teachers. For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy", the organization has the resources to organize the evaluation of the practical skills of residents (dissection of a corpse, macro and microscopic diagnosis of surgical and biopsy materials, etc.) Experts have established that the educational program takes into account the requirements of the law, in including in relation to procedural rules.

The organization of education ensures that the structure, content and duration of the educational program are adjusted in the event of any changes in different sciences, demographics, as well as in response to the needs of the health care system.

*Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 72.5% are completely satisfied, 16.25% are partially satisfied, 7.5% are not satisfied.*

*The organization has its own clinical base: the CF "UMC" National Scientific Centre for Maternity and Childhood - a multidisciplinary hospital with 500 beds, the CF "UMC" National Cardiac Surgery Centre - a cardiac surgery centre with 200 beds, and the CF "UMC" Republican Diagnostic Centre with a capacity of 800 visits per shift. And to the survey question "Is there sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)", 90% of residents responded with complete agreement, 5% partially agreed, 2.5% disagreed. At the same time, 73.75% of residents claim that after completing classes the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).*

At the same time, to the question "Do resident representatives participate in the development of educational programs?", the experts received the following answer - yes, they do.

*The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (67.5%), 20% are partially satisfied, 12.5% are not.*

In accordance with the 2022 State Compulsory Educational Standards, the structure of the EP consists of a mandatory component (134 credits) and an optional component (4 credits). Also, 2 credits are allocated for the end-of-course assessment. Thus, the labour intensity for training a pathologist is 140 credits ([https://epvo.kz/register/education\\_program/application/46573](https://epvo.kz/register/education_program/application/46573)). The 2020 State Compulsory Educational Standards syllabus reflects the required competencies of the 1st year of study and includes a list of rotations by discipline. Thus, rotations for the 2023-2024 academic years include the disciplines - general and particular pathology, Clinical pathomorphology in obstetrics and gynaecology, clinical pathomorphology in paediatrics, clinical pathomorphology in paediatrics (<https://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2023/10/rupl-patanatomiya-2023.pdf>).

The residency educational program guarantees the integration of practice and theory includes the content, sequence of training and responsibility of the residency student with the definition of goals and learning outcomes based on the completion of tasks and the provision of medical care to the population. Integration of training and provision of medical services implies, on the one hand, the provision of proper medical care by residency students, and on the other hand, that educational opportunities are embedded in job functions. Training is based on practice, involving residency students in personal participation in the provision of services and responsibility for activities to provide care to patients in medical organizations recognized as residency bases. In CF "UMC" this is reflected in the privilege sheets of each resident.

*The schedule of training sessions in the EP disciplines is completely satisfactory for 67.5% of the residents surveyed, partially – for 20%, and dissatisfied – for 12.5%.*

#### **2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care**

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the pathology department of the National Scientific Centre for Maternity and Childhood of the CF "UMC" and

conversations with the director and employees. At the same time, verification of **standard 2** showed that the CF "UMC" unites three innovative healthcare facilities located in Astana:

1) Centre CF "UMC" Republican diagnostic centre with a capacity of 800 visits per shift. The branch provides a wide range of consultative and diagnostic assistance based on high technologies, including using nuclear medicine methods. Residency programs are implemented on the basis of centres of the CF "UMC" accredited by the international commission JCI.

2) Centre of the CF "UMC" National Scientific Centre for Maternity and Childhood is a multidisciplinary hospital with 500 beds, which provides specialized and highly specialized care in the field of paediatrics, paediatric surgery, neonatology, obstetrics-gynaecology and in vitro fertilization.

3) Centre of the KF "UMC" National Cardiac Surgery Centre is a cardiac surgery centre with 200 beds. The centre provides medical services in all areas of modern cardiology, cardiac surgery, interventional cardiology, all clinical services and inpatient care. One of the unique achievements of the Centre is the implantation of Ventricular assist device VAD. Inpatient care is provided using modern diagnostic and treatment equipment.

To master clinical skills, students have the opportunity to undergo training in departments of various profiles in accordance with the topics of practical classes and those competencies that are defined in the educational programs of specialties. While studying at clinical bases, resident doctors have the opportunity to gain knowledge of pathological diagnostics of surgical and biopsy material of various profiles (surgical, gynaecological, etc.).

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including the pathoanatomical department, a total of 5 meetings were held and during cross-interviews it was established that the residents fully mastered practical and theoretical skills using rich pathological anatomical material.

Thus, responsibility for choosing the basis for clinical training and practice of a resident in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is assigned to the Department of Education and the criterion is the profile and number of patients necessary for residents to acquire the appropriate skills. Experts analysed information about the availability of accreditation of clinical sites and concluded that the **resident training sites were compliant**.

The training of residents in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since when analysing the shortage of specialists for 2023, it was found that there is an acute shortage of pathologists in almost all regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Therefore, this organization provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in the field of "Pathological Anatomy". Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information that residents are constantly trained at clinical bases, where they have a greater opportunity to master clinical skills and acquire theoretical knowledge and teachers confirmed that residents are trained directly in clinical departments. Residents of this specialty can conduct pathological examinations of surgical and biopsy material.

This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out in the organization. The mentors of pathology residents are physicians with the highest qualification category who have passed certification. *Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. 72.5% of residents completely agree that teachers provided them with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, partially agree - 16.25%, completely disagree - 7.5%.*

*91.25% of residents noted that they were completely satisfied that there was a sufficient number of patients to supervise or assist in operations; 2.5% - partially satisfied; did not answer - 6.25%.*

*The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (67.5%), "partially" 20%, not satisfied - 12.5%.*

*Of the 56 residents surveyed, 70% responded that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 3.75% believe that it is rare and 10% - sometimes, they*

*do not know what it is - 11.25% doubt it the answer was 1.25%, never used – 3.75%. When visiting an educational organization, experts did not see any problems in introducing new teaching methods, but recommended using different methods.*

Integration between training and the provision of pathological diagnostics (on-the-job training) is achieved through dissection of cadavers, review of surgical and biopsy materials.

The following employees took part in the planning, discussion, approval and review of the educational program in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” - academic staff, mentors, employers, and students.

*Of the residents surveyed, 85% noted satisfaction with the activities of mentors, curators and scientific supervisors, 6.25% were partially satisfied, 6.25% were partially dissatisfied, and 2.5% of respondents had doubts about the answer.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** correspond out of 22 standards (including 19 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 21, partially -1, do not correspond - 0.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To actively apply PBL and CBL teaching methods in the educational process.
2. To develop syllabuses for each discipline (Standard 2.1.4).

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES**

#### **3.1 Evaluation methods**

The study of control and measurement tools (50 tests, 50 tasks) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate evaluation policy that allows for a comprehensive evaluation of the educational achievements of residents, including the following: portfolio of a resident physician; attendance log; discipline reports and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. There was no appeal in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy”. The evaluation covers not only knowledge and skills, but also professional behaviour and communication skills, which is confirmed by checklists.

The criteria for admission to the end-of-course assessment are the results of intermediate assessment. This is documented in the Rules for the Organization of Postgraduate Education in the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre”, approved by decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” No. 6 dated March 29, 2021.

The admission of resident doctors to the end-of-course assessment is issued by order of the supervising head of the CF "UMC" according to the list no later than two weeks before the start of the end-of-course assessment and is submitted to the certification commission.

Validation and evaluation of the reliability of resident evaluation methods (tests, tasks, cases) is carried out as follows: The Department of Science and Education together with the Science and Education Sector of the CF “UMC” carries out recording and monitoring of evaluation forms throughout the entire training. Reviewed evaluation forms are kept in the resident physician's portfolio.

In the organization of education, there is a practice of involving external examiners in evaluating residents, which is documented in the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" on March 29, 2021 No. 6 according to paragraph 45, a comprehensive exam in the specialty is carried out in the form of testing and evaluation of practical medical skills. This ensures the independence and objectivity of the evaluation results.

Testing and measurement tools are not peer-reviewed. The head of the education department replied that additions and updates to the control and measurement tools are planned.

There is a document on appealing the assessment results - The procedure for the work of the appeal commission during entrance examinations to residency is described in section 4 of the Rules for admission to residency of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of CF "UMC" on March 1, 2018 No. 5. To date, residents of the appeal with There were no residents on the side.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with employee Syzdykova A.A. Director of the Department of Education, the commission verified that there is a documentation system in place that is transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, faculty and resident agreements, and instructional documentation (work program, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and verifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain documents necessary for residents and contain information that is regularly updated.

*During a visit to the organization, management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the evaluation process?"* And the answer was received: in 2019, by order dated June 28, 2019 No. 03-k, the chief physician of the MSI at the REM "Perinatal Centre No. 2", Candidate of Medicine, Urazbaeva G.G. was appointed by the chairman of the State Attestation Commission. Since 2020, the State Certification Commission has been called the Final Certification Commission (FCC). Since 2020, the head of the Centre for Molecular Medicine, obstetrician-gynaecologist, candidate of medical sciences B.A. Turakbaeva was appointed by the chairman of the FCC. In 2021, T.B. Dautov, Director of the Department of Radiology and Nuclear Medicine, was appointed by the Chairman of the FCC. In 2022-2023, Chairman of the FCC D.B. Jenaliev, Director of the Clinical Academic Department of Paediatric Surgery.

Evaluation of students' educational achievements is carried out using criteria, regulations and procedures developed in accordance with the set goals and objectives for the implementation of educational programs and assigned qualifications within the framework of the current point-rating system and control of the educational process in accordance with directive, external and internal regulations.

CF "UMC" adheres to the requirements of working curricula in disciplines, which reflect various forms and methods of monitoring students' knowledge, including testing, oral questioning, and passing practical skills. CF "UMC" is independent in choosing the forms, order and frequency of ongoing monitoring of students' progress in accordance with Article 28, paragraph 7 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education".

To implement postgraduate education programs, determine the procedure for organizing and implementing educational programs, as well as the procedure for training medical personnel in residency, CF "UMC" developed "Rules for organizing the educational process in residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre", approved by the decision of the Board of CF "UMC" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6.

According to the current Rules, students are provided with a reference guide (<http://umc.org.kz/about/science/rezidentura/rezidentam/reference-guide-entering-residency.php>) for the entire period of study, a syllabus on the discipline, which also describes the principles and resident evaluation methods.

Evaluation of the educational achievements of students is carried out on the basis of an evaluation of the level of competencies developed by the teacher together with the sectors of science and education of the centres of the CF "UMC" in various forms: test questions, tasks in test form, a list of practical skills, situational tasks, evaluation of the level of mastery of a particular resident doctor manipulations, tasks for laboratory and other work. At CF "UMC", monitoring and internal control of the quality of teaching and educational achievements of students is carried out through current, intermediate, end-of-course control in the discipline and is focused on learning outcomes.

The academic achievements of a resident doctor are evaluated on a 100-point scale corresponding to the letter system accepted in international practice with a digital equivalent on a 4-point scale, which is recorded by the Department of Education at CF "UMC".

Documentation reflecting the educational achievements of a resident physician includes the following:

- 1) portfolio of a resident doctor;

- 2) attendance register;
- 3) statements of discipline.

To monitor and evaluate the current performance of resident doctors, CF "UMC" uses criteria-based evaluation, including formative evaluation, summative evaluation, and a list of practical skills. The educational achievements of a resident doctor are evaluated on a 100-point scale corresponding to the letter system accepted in international practice (positive grades, in descending order, from "A" to "D", "unsatisfactory" - "F") with a corresponding digital equivalent of 4 -x point scale.

During a visit to the clinical site and an interview with the head of the department, the commission was convinced that there was a documentation system that was transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, and included documents such as annual plans, annual reports, department regulations, contracts with teachers and residents, full educational and methodological documentation (EP, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and verifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary information for EMCD residents and contain information that is regularly updated.

*The survey showed that 81.25% of residents were completely satisfied with the methods of evaluating knowledge and skills, and 8.75% were partially satisfied.*

*Of all respondents, 70% answered that teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in classes, 10% expressed the opinion that such teaching methods are used only sometimes, "rarely" 3.75%, "don't know what it is" - 11.25%.*

*According to the survey results, 73.75% responded that after completing classes, the teacher constantly gives them feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini survey, works on mistakes), 10% believe that sometimes, 5% - rarely, 7.5% - never, don't know what to answer 3.75%.*

### **3.2 Relationship between evaluation and learning**

Accounting and monitoring of evaluation forms is carried out by the Department of Science and Education together with the science and education sector of the CF "UMC" throughout the entire training. Reviewed evaluation forms are kept in the resident physician's portfolio. In accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6, the formation of a policy for the evaluation of resident doctors is within the competence of curators, clinical mentors, teachers, structural units, supervising the residency of the CF "UMC". The knowledge of resident doctors of the CF "UMC" is evaluated through the use of various types of test tasks. Test questions are compiled according to the thematic plan of the student's working curriculum. The resident's evaluation includes a current evaluation (based on formative, summative evaluation forms), an end-of-course assessment based on the results of the discipline in the form of an oral exam or in the form of testing and solving situational problems. At the end of each academic period, intermediate certification is carried out in the form of passing test questions developed on the basis of state compulsory residency education standards. Skills are evaluated using summative assessment forms, which allow assessing not only the absence or presence of skills of a resident doctor, but also the degree of confidence with which he performs a particular manipulation. Professional behaviour and attitude are evaluated through direct observation at the patient's bedside, questionnaires from a team of specialists in the department, and analysis of documentation required to be maintained by a resident doctor, including a portfolio.

In the Instructions for the development of educational and methodological documentation and a system for evaluating the educational achievements of resident doctors of the CF "UMC" (approved by the decision of the Educational and Methodological Council No. 2 of May 13, 2021), in subparagraph 20 "Assessment of resident doctors is based on the principles of academic integrity, which is the basic principle of the learning process."

In order to develop the principles of academic integrity, changes were made to the methods of evaluating resident doctors at the end-of-course assessment. In the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" on March 29, 2021 No. 6, according to paragraph 45, a comprehensive examination in the specialty is carried out in the form of testing and evaluation of practical medical skills.

As part of the integration of the CF "UMC" and the National Cardiac Surgery Centre, Foundation employees received access to the Anti-Plagiarism system.

The interviewed representatives of employers also pointed out that the training of graduates of the CF "UMC" corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since residents are trained in a clinic with all the powerful human resources and the necessary full equipment to provide qualified and high-tech pathological diagnostics. Employers said that they themselves participate in the evaluation of residents, since they are included in the examination commissions. CF "UMC" systematically provides feedback to employers. Employers evaluate pathologist residents' skills on an ongoing basis and give high marks during interviews. They also believe that they wanted to see the strongest skills in residency graduates, such as critical thinking and communication skills.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria* comply with 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): *fully – 4/3, partially – 2/0, do not comply – 0.*

***Recommendations for improvement:***

1. The evaluation of residents should be brought into line with the point-rating system (Standard 3.1.1).
2. Automate the evaluation of the validity of test items (Standard 3.1.4).

## **Standard 4: TRAINEES**

### **4.1 Admissions policy and selection**

Admission to residency is carried out on the basis of Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 “On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education”, Orders of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15 2020 No. KR MOH-270/2020 “On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to education and training of medical personnel in residency” and dated March 15, 2023 “On amendments to some orders of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan” and in accordance with the Rules admission to the residency program of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated March 1, 2018 No. 5.

Persons who have a document confirming the qualification of a “doctor” are accepted into the residency program of the CF “UMC”. Persons who received medical education abroad provide a document recognizing their education and (or) awarding the qualification “doctor”. Citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan are given the right to receive, on a competitive basis in accordance with the state educational order, free postgraduate education if they are receiving education at this level for the first time, as well as on a paid basis. According to the internal Rules for admission to the residency of the CF "UMC", persons who have a grade for the end-of-course assessment of the internship of at least 3.33 points and a grade point average (GPA) of at least 3.0 are allowed to take the entrance exams to the residency of the CF "UMC".

Persons who have certificates of passing the English language test (Test of English as a Foreign Language Institutional Testing Program (TOEFL ITP - at least 163 points), Test of English as a Foreign Language Institutional Testing Program Internet-based Test (TOEFL IBT, threshold score - no less than 46), Test of English as a Foreign Language Paper-based testing (TOEFL PBT) threshold score - at least 453 points, Test of English as a Foreign Language

Paper-delivered testing (TOEFL PDT) threshold score - no less than 65, International English Language Tests System (IELTS, threshold score - no less than 5.0) according to the criteria of the evaluation sheet, an additional 25 points are added to the final results of the entrance exams .

Thus, the CF "UMC" sets higher requirements for those entering the residency program of the CF "UMC" in comparison with the national requirements.

Admission of students to the CF "UMC" is carried out annually according to the study of the needs of practical healthcare and the capabilities of the clinical base, the availability of appropriate patients, the number of operations, etc.

Thus, experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all criteria are met, there are no shortcomings. The experts reviewed the documentation for the admission of residents, including the Academic Policy. Experts surveyed clinical mentors about academic advising practices, personal support for residents, and the development of more than just professional skills.

#### **4.2 Number of residents**

The number of admitted residents is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum permissible load on academic staff, the provision of educational, educational, methodological and scientific literature, as well as the material and technical resources of the University.

Specialty 7R0112 "Pathological Anatomy" at the CF "UMC" has existed since 2021, admission of residents was under a grant from the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

#### **4.3 Support and counselling for residents**

In the context of the implementation of a competency-oriented model of medical education, a consulting system operates at the CF "UMC". For this purpose, by order of the head of the CF "UMC", for the entire period of residency training, each student is assigned a curator who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, in the selection of disciplines and teachers based on work with the catalogue of disciplines and the working curriculum plan, supervises the clinical, educational and research activities of the student and mastery of practical skills. The curator can also provide advisory assistance in resolving issues of a future career, determining the direction of research, choosing a supervisor, and determining the basis for industrial practice. Clinical mentors conduct educational work with the resident doctors assigned to them on issues of improving their academic performance, discipline and class attendance, and attracting them to participate in the public life of CF "UMC". The clinical mentor is appointed from among the academic staff of the CF "UMC".

During the training and before the examination session, the leading doctors of the centres of the CF "UMC", involved in the training of resident doctors, provide consultations for students.

Department of Education staff provides consultations to resident doctors upon request (if questions arise) or as needed.

In addition, employees of the Department of Education provide consultations for those wishing to enrol in studies at the CF "UMC". Consultation is carried out on the provision of a list of documents, which specialties are subject to training.

The residency training process at CF "UMC" includes introductory and internal instruction by resident doctors on:

- 1) rules for handling medicines;
- 2) international goals for patient safety;
- 3) safety codes;
- 4) incident reports;
- 5) fire safety and emergency preparedness, etc.



If the requirements of JCI standards, rules of conduct in the specialized department, requirements of sanitary and epidemiological regulations, International Patient Safety Objectives are not met, an incident is registered against the resident doctor.

Employees of the Department of Science and Education, as well as the science and education sector of the centres of the CF "UMC", together with the quality management and patient safety department and other interested parties, hold meetings to review incidents. The protocol decision on the analysis of incidents is communicated to the resident doctor and other students to prevent such violations.

In addition, in order to improve the organization of the educational process at the CF "UMC", the Department of Science and Education annually, following the results of the academic year, conducts a "360 degree survey", the participants of which are resident doctors of all years of study, curators, supervising doctors, teachers, patients of doctors - residents. The results of the survey are announced at the EMC meeting. The results of the survey are further used by stakeholders to improve the educational process at CF "UMC".

As part of the analysis of the residency program for the 2022-2023 academic year, a "360" survey was conducted (<https://umckaz.qualtrics.com/Q/MyProjectsSection?>). The survey included resident doctors of the 1st, 2nd and 3rd years of training of all specialties. The evaluation uses a 10 point scale.

During the conversation between EEC experts and residents, it was established that CF "UMC" has created and provides safe learning conditions for residents. To protect the interests of residents and provide them with assistance in educational, scientific, and extracurricular activities, various services are provided for organizing advisory, psychological, social, and medical support for students. EEC experts have confirmed that experienced teachers and professors are involved in the consultation. In addition, before the start of each module, the group teacher informs his residents about his work schedule and the time when residents can seek consultations in this discipline.

For personal growth and development, holding sports and creative events, the team has a sufficient resource base (Internet, 100% WIFI coverage of the centre, library, computer classes, reconstructed and landscaped areas of the centre buildings). The training rooms are equipped with projectors, a screen, a video wall, and all the necessary organizational equipment technology.

To develop the intellectual level of residents and expand their knowledge in various scientific fields, residents take an active part in scientific and practical conferences held by the university. Residents are involved in the work of the Council of Young Scientists, where emerging problematic issues are also resolved. *According to the survey: in the process of training residents, a variety of teaching methods are used: lectures (78.13%), oral discussion of the topic (93.75%), rewriting thematic information from monographs (12.5%), problem-based learning (75.63%), interactive training (46.88%), completing essays (21.88%), completing projects, coursework (25%), practical classes on clinical skills in a clinical training centre (34.38%), analysis situational problems (62.5%), compiling and solving cases (43.75%), oral questioning of students (50%), solving tests (40.63%), work in small groups (34.38%), written completion assignments (12.5%).*

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

During the conversation with representatives, it was found out that the quality of the implementation of the educational program is ensured by the participation of residents in discussing the mission of the EP, access to which is made available through posting on the website of the CF "UMC". Along with managers and teachers, residents are included to participate in the consideration of issues related to the educational process and approval of educational materials for residency, the development of an individual working curriculum and elective disciplines. This fact was confirmed by residents during their interviews. *According to the survey results, 66.25% of respondents believe that program directors and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council,*



*educational program committees), 6.25% answered that no, they do not involve, while 17.5% do not know about this, 7.5% doubt the answer, sometimes - 2.5%.*

When visiting the EEC experts, it was confirmed that feedback from residents is collected at the stage of mastering the taught discipline (at the end of studying the discipline), as well as on issues related to learning/working conditions and problem situations.

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

According to the standards of international accreditation JCI, internal regulatory documents of the CF "UMC", given that the CF "UMC" is a university clinic, upon admission to treatment, each patient signs an informed consent that resident doctors take part in the diagnostic and treatment procedures, etc.

Resident doctors undergo training at clinical sites, according to a schedule of disciplines. Depending on the year of study and the level of theoretical and practical knowledge, a list of privileges is drawn up for each resident doctor in accordance with the requirements of JCI international accreditation standards. A privilege sheet is a document-permission from a resident doctor who has access to patients of the CF "UMC". This document contains a list of medical services/manipulations/operations and the degree of independence of each resident doctor studying at the CF "UMC". The completed Privilege Sheet is checked and signed by the resident doctor, the resident doctor's supervisor, agreed upon by the head of the centres' departments and approved by the head of the corresponding centre of the CF "UMC", on the basis of which the training takes place. Students maintain the necessary documentation, which reflects all the work done for the entire period of study in their specialty.

*75% of residents responded that they personally have access to equipment (educational and real) in order to master practical skills in their specialty; 12.5% partially agreed. There are rooms for conducting theoretical classes with residents; there is a separate room for rest, changing clothes, eating, etc.*

*71.25% of residents are completely satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the training rooms and classrooms of this educational organization, 23.75% are partially satisfied, 1.25% is completely dissatisfied.*

The teaching load of residents is planned in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education". The class schedule from 08.00 to 17.00 is regulated by educational programs developed on the basis of State Compulsory Educational Standards 2022, sanitary and epidemiological rules and regulations, curricula and recommendations of health and education authorities.

Residency work is the primary and dominant responsibility of the resident.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Complies with 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): *completely -20.*

***Recommendations for improvement: none***

### **Standard 5: TRAINERS**

#### **5.1 Recruitment and selection policy**

Experts of the EEC confirmed that, according to the State Compulsory Educational Standard (as amended in 2022), the indicators for the qualitative composition of teaching staff conducting classes with resident doctors are the following: the presence of an academic degree, academic title, work as a full-time teacher or carrying out part-time activities, experience practical activities, scientific and pedagogical work experience. The number and composition of teaching staff are planned based on the needs of the educational process, the standard teaching load per teacher and student population.

Teaching staff must have complete knowledge and master modern teaching methods, the necessary skills and experience, not only for the effective transfer of knowledge to students during the educational process, but also for instilling practical skills and abilities. Teachers of

clinical specialties of the CF "UMC" are leading experts in the relevant areas of practical healthcare.

With an academic degree, first or highest qualification category, having appropriate training in the field of medical education.

The composition of teachers and curators of the CF "UMC" is agreed upon by the heads of clinical departments, reviewed by the EMC, and approved by order of the head of the EMC or a person authorized by him annually, taking into account new admissions for the corresponding academic year.

The academic staff of the CF "UMC" in 2023 in residency is represented by: 13 doctors of medical sciences; 23 candidates of medical sciences; 3 PhD; 3 masters; 6 professors; 2 associate professors; doctors of the highest (75 doctors), first (4 doctors) and second (2) categories.

According to paragraph 7 of the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan for residency in medical specialties, which was approved and put into effect by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No. KR MOH-63, a resident doctor works under the supervision of a mentor at residency bases during the discipline cycle and/or a module with regular assessment and feedback. Upon completion of the discipline cycle and (or) module, the student is certified in the manner established by the EMC Faculty of Sciences. A clinical mentor is appointed from among qualified practical healthcare specialists working at residency bases with at least 5 years of experience in the relevant specialty. The work schedule and the procedure for assigning a mentor are determined by the residency base independently in agreement with the CF "UMC".

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes the policy of recruiting and hiring teachers and clinical mentors, stimulation and motivation of practical healthcare specialists.

*When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (81.25%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization, but 15.63% are partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 87.5% completely agree, 12.5% partially agree.*

## **5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development**

Planning of educational and supervisory work of academic staff is carried out in accordance with standard educational programs. Every year, in accordance with the Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process, in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by decision of the Board of March 29, 2021 No. 6, the work of the teacher and curator is regulated, based on the order of the head of the CF "UMC", a list of academic staff and curators is approved.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the human resources department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes lectures and practical classes, joint dissection of corpses, viewing glass preparations of surgical and biopsy materials, participation in consultations, conferences, preparation for a journal club, grand round, discussion of a clinical case.

Experts determined that faculty and residents have adequate time for teaching, mentoring, and learning. The work schedule of teachers is established in the Rules for the organization of the educational process, in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by decision of the Board of March 29, 2021 No. 6. Working time is 7.5 hours. Teachers conduct seminars lasting 2 hours. Time for clinical reviews, clinical rounds was approved according to the internal regulations of the Centre.

The experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is conducted annually, and 3 teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program were trained in 2022, including teachers of the accredited educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" - 2 people. These events are financed by the educational organization. Experts have verified teacher certificates on such topics «Minimally Invasive Tissue Sampling

(MITS) Technique Training conducted by the MITS Alliance Secretariat and sponsored by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation

30.09.2019 – 04.10.2019 JJM Medical College Davangere, India; “Introduction of an innovative algorithm for histological and immunohistochemical examination of the endometrium depending on the phase of the menstrual cycle for infertility of various origins and reproductive losses” (40 hours) 10.28.2019 – 11.01.2019, Federal State Budgetary Scientific Institution “Research Institute of Obstetrics, Gynaecology and Reproductive Medicine named after D.O. Otta”, St. Petersburg, Russian Federation;

The salary fund of teachers consists of government orders and paid services. *During the survey, 40.63% of teaching staff were satisfied with the salary, 21.88% were not satisfied, 9.8% did not answer.*

*Regarding support for participation in conferences (international, republican), 25% of teachers paid for travel, travel expenses, registration fees, 15.63% did not pay expenses, 21.88% did not contact management about this, and 25% did not answer.*

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. Confirmation of this fact was obtained during a conversation with residents.

*There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 81.25% of surveyed teachers responded, and 18.75% partially agreed with this. According to the survey results, 43.75% of teachers attended professional development courses during a given year, from 1 to 5 years ago - 34.38%; 15.63% \* over 5 years ago, 3.13% - don't remember when it was.*

*The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 40.63% answered that “yes, there are such programs”, 0% “I have already taken advantage of this”, 6.25% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 34.38% of respondents don't know about it.*

*At the same time, 85% of the surveyed residents are satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators and scientific supervisors, 6.25% are partially satisfied*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard improvement): *fully - 8.*

**Recommendations for improvement: none**

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

Resident training is carried out on the basis of the CF "UMC", with a total capacity of 475 inpatient beds and 500 outpatient visits per shift, which combines two innovative medical centres: Diagnostic Centre, Centre for Maternity and Childhood, Republican Diagnostic Centre (RDC), among others residents of an accredited educational program in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” on the basis of the NSCMC. There are a total of 475 inpatient beds and 500 outpatient visits per shift. There are 3 classrooms, 2 conference rooms for seminars and journal clubs, 5 laboratories (clinical, biochemical, bacteriological, enzyme immunoassay, PCR), a library with 34 seats, a computer class and a test centre with 11 seats.

The experts visited the library, which has access for residents and employees. The total amount of literature on paper is 1736 pieces (tables for standard 6). Monographs on the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” are available in the library.

There is access to international databases: PubMed, Up to Date, Medline Complete, Clinical Key, Access medicine, Clinical trials, Cochrane Library and access to the Republican Scientific and Technical Medical Library, JSC National Centre for Scientific and Technical Information. Residents are aware of this. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his training. The updating of the material and technical base,

including the library background, is carried out annually. The number of new arrivals over 5 years amounted to 480 pieces.

*A survey of residents showed that 61.25% completely agree that they are provided with the necessary educational literature, 27.5% partially agree, and 2.5% doubt the answer.*

*A survey of teachers showed that 78.13% of respondents completely agree that the organization has enough equipment and resources to conduct training for residents in accredited programs, 21.88% partially agree.*

*96.88% were completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, 3.13% were partially satisfied.*

*81.25% of teachers are completely satisfied with the organization of labour and the workplace at CF "UMS", 15.63% are partially satisfied.*

## **6.2 Clinical sites**

A review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical bases of the CF "UMC" were visited, with a total capacity of 475 inpatient beds and 500 outpatient visits per shift, which combines two innovative medical centres: Diagnostic Centre, Centre motherhood and childhood, and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff and the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient amount of surgical and biopsy materials, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students; teachers provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology.

During a visit to the clinical bases of the NCMC, experts examined the resources, their compliance with training programs, accessibility for teachers and residents, to what extent this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time to work with surgical and biopsy material, preparation of pathological protocols, etc., work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs, resource availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, evaluation methods, and purposefully entered this organization, because they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment in organizing training, assessing their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research and development, financing, demonstrated proficiency in English when answering questions from foreign experts Ziganshina L. E, Saatova G.M. Experts examined residents' documents (portfolios, resident assessment results, checklists, residents' survey results).

The experts received evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

## **6.3 Information technology**

Experts evaluated the access of residents and teachers to the necessary web resources. There is a computer lab with an area of 22.0 m<sup>2</sup> for 14 computers with Internet access and access to foreign databases of scientific and educational literature such as Elsevier, Web of Knowledge (THOMSON REUTERS), SPRINGER (SpringerLink), Clarivate Analytics, EBSCO: Medline Complete and DynaMed Plus, Wiley Online Library; BMJ, which provides resident doctors and students with the latest data on the achievements of medical science and practice, including in preparation for classes.

The educational program uses technologies such as immunohistochemical. During self-study, residents use a wide base of information resources, which is reflected when visiting the library: Cochrane Library, CBS eBooks, EBSCO, BMJ Learning, BMJ Learning, "Doctor's Consultant", "Student's Consultant", "Epigraph", "Aknurpress", There are also corporate

subscriptions Web of Science (Clarivate), Scopus Elsevier, Science Direct. The resident reviews 5-10 cases of surgical or biopsy materials per day, including completing the necessary documentation under the supervision of the teacher.

Such elements of distance methods for implementing advanced training programs using distance educational technologies (DET), since 2016, CF “UMC” has implemented an e-learning management system based on the Moodle platform: <http://umc.org.kz/moodle/>

At the time of the visit, all residents were at clinical sites, and videos of previously conducted distance learning sessions were watched. When preparing educational and methodological literature, teachers use educational resources of the library (electronic textbooks, electronic manuals, scanned educational literature), the Internet, as well as the results of their own scientific and research activities.

*72.5% of residents responded that they fully agree with the provision of methodological and didactic materials and additional literature for students to prepare for classes.*

#### **6.4 Clinical teams**

Every day, resident pathologists participate in joint dissections of corpses with their mentors, diagnostic activities (viewing surgical and biopsy material, etc.). Residents also conduct seminars on topical problems of pathological anatomy, where students are students of all levels, as well as healthcare and teaching staff. Students and residents develop skills in coordinating work with colleagues and other healthcare professionals during clinical and anatomical conferences.

*In the questionnaire, residents noted that this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty - 85% completely agree with this, 2.5% partially agree, 6.25% found it difficult to answer.*

*90% of residents answered the question “Is there enough time for practical training? - Completely agree 5% - partially agree.*

#### **6.5 Medical research and advances**

The educational organization carries out research work in all areas, according to Budget program 024 “Targeted contribution to AEO “Nazarbayev University””

Residents of 1 and 2 years of study are involved in the implementation of scientific work (or fragments). They perform such types of work as research. All information about scientific work is included in the resident’s portfolio.

The educational program includes topics where residents study research methods in medicine. In this case, the total hours are 4 credits.

If residents carry out scientific and practical research, they are provided with access to instrumental and laboratory equipment.

During a conversation with residents, it was found that they take an active part in the implementation of scientific work at clinical sites.

*62.5% of residents confirmed that they are currently engaged in scientific work under the guidance of their teacher or mentor, 3.75% are not engaged, 18.75% have begun planning research work, 12.5% are searching for a research topic, 15.9% of residents do not want to do research.*

An interview with teachers showed that there are no problems in managing education, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of case patients, surgical procedures, etc., time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

#### **6.6 Educational expertise**

Examination of the quality of the implemented educational program for residency at the University is a systemic process and is carried out by the following structures: DAR (approval of EP), Dean's Office of Internship and Residency (implementation of EP), Committee of Educational Programs (EP) (planning, development and evaluation of EP), OEMC (monitoring EP), Quality Management System Department. The CEP includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, and students. The Accreditation and Rating Department monitors various aspects of educational activities to obtain independent information aimed at

improving the quality of the organization of the educational process. In the process of each study, recommendations were formed for making changes in order to improve the organization of the educational process in departments and modules of the university.

The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. *According to the survey results, 73.75% of respondents were completely satisfied with the organization of teaching, 15% were partially satisfied.*

### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

The academic policy for resident training includes the possibility of training at alternative organizations if existing clinical sites do not cover all topics of the educational program.

The preparation of scientific publications is carried out under the guidance of a teacher and does not require additional training bases. However, residents can participate in academic mobility both within the country and abroad (University of Ljubljana, Faculty of Medicine), Ljubljana, Slovenia; Medical Park Florya, Istanbul, Turkey; Giannina Gaslini Institute, Via Gerolamo Gaslini, Genoa, Italy; State budgetary healthcare institution "Children's City Clinical Hospital named after N.F. Filatov" Department of Health, Moscow, Russian Federation; Rabin Medical Centre, Beilinson and Hasharon Hospital, Tel -Aviv, Israel Resident pathologists have not yet travelled on academic mobility, due to the opening of the specialty literally in 2021.

Teachers of educational organizations actively participate in republican and international events. Thus, 1 teacher took part in the Anniversary scientific and practical conference of paediatricians and paediatric surgeons of Kazakhstan with international participation "Paediatrics of Kazakhstan: yesterday, today and tomorrow", dedicated to the 90th anniversary of the Scientific Centre of Paediatrics and Paediatric Surgery "Structural distribution and analysis of solid tumours of childhood in CF "UMC". Such participation allows you to apply the information received in the educational process.

Over the period of 5 years, under the budget program 024 "Targeted contribution to the AEO "Nazarbayev University"", 17 employees of the CF "UMC" were trained abroad in 2021, 9 in 2022, 10 master classes were conducted in various clinical areas in 2020-2023.

The opportunity to train residents in other medical organizations is ensured by concluded agreements between the University and the Health Departments of 4 regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan and 52 agreements/memorandums with foreign universities and research centres in 83 countries. The possibility of academic freedom is determined by the fact that the EP is developed on the basis of the National Qualifications Framework, which corresponds to the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Correspond to 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): *completely -18.*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none*

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

Monitoring of the educational program includes discussion among academic staff, residents, employers, mentors and other stakeholders, which ensures transparency of the process and results. An annual analysis of the educational program will allow the educational organization to make adjustments and improve the content. Initially, the educational program was developed in 2021 without the State Compulsory Educational Standard, and was redone in 2022 according to the State Compulsory Educational Standard-22 (there is no review of the EP).

When evaluating the program, the goals and objectives of training and the final learning outcomes are taken into account (through assessment of residents, independent examination). The process of implementing the educational program is assessed through feedback from residents and teachers and the achievements of graduates. The specialty is accredited for the first

time and therefore there is no data on the evaluation of EP in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy”.

The selection and compliance of teachers and teaching methods is also carried out through feedback from residents. There is no such data in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” due to primary accreditation.

Evaluation of methods for evaluating the knowledge and skills of residents is carried out using autopsies of corpses, viewing glass slides of surgical and biopsy materials, the ability to make a pathological diagnosis, draw up a pathological protocol, compare clinical and pathological diagnoses, etc. and demonstrate the level of acquired skills and abilities.

An evaluation of the sufficiency and quality of educational resources is carried out by the EMC and shows that there is a need for any adjustments.

In the process of evaluating the quality of residency educational programs, it was found that, along with achievements, there are a number of problems and shortcomings, including the fact that it is necessary to discuss the EP with a wider range of external and internal stakeholders.

### **7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents**

Faculty and residents have the opportunity to participate in the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the educational program on a regular basis through various feedback channels. Feedback on the EP specialty “Pathological Anatomy” is carried out once a year, Ibraimov B, responsible for residency, is responsible for collecting and processing the results of the discussion.

To survey teachers, a questionnaire was developed that included questions on EP, including the specialty “Pathological Anatomy”. The results of the survey of teachers conducted in 2022 *and for 2023 are not presented*.

A survey of residents is carried out once a year, but has not yet been conducted for the specialty “Pathological Anatomy”. The survey is carried out according to the following types: “Teacher through the eyes of students”, Student satisfaction with the conditions and results of training”, “Satisfaction with the infrastructure”, “Graduate satisfaction with the quality of education”, “freshman questionnaire”.

### **7.3 Resident and Graduate Outcomes**

The results of residents and graduates are indicators of the quality of educational programs. The final results of the assessment of residents in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” in 2023 show the following: there are knowledge gaps on some topics, which are taken into account for the future.

Thus, the results of an independent assessment of residents in 2023 showed that the graduate scored 76% based on the results of the NCIE examination. The experts noted the following successes in the clinical training of residents: practical skills at a very good level. At the same time, experts also identified shortcomings in the clinical training of residents, which are associated with the fact that they work only with clinical material – children’s material and maternal material. There are no other nosologies.

Monitoring of residency program graduates is carried out through employer surveys. Residents of the class of 2023 (1 person in total) were employed at the PUB in Astana. The percentage of employment over 5 years in the specialty “Pathological Anatomy” cannot be analysed due to the fact that there was only one graduation in 2023.

Since the entire process of training and monitoring of residents is concentrated in the department of postgraduate education, the results of assessing the clinical practice of residents and graduates immediately go to the responsible persons. To improve the educational process in the last 2-3 years, the following has been done: An important role in evaluating the educational program is played by the results of the final certification of residents, carried out at the testing stage by the National Centre for Independent Examination, as well as the results of certification exams conducted by the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Health and social development of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

### **7.4 Stakeholder engagement**

Educational organizations have approaches to involving teachers and residents in evaluating the educational program and monitoring its implementation. Thus, residents are included in the advisory body and participate in the discussion of all issues of the educational process. The results of the evaluation of the educational program are announced at a meeting of the Academic Council.

*No interviews were conducted with employers.*

Participation of a wide range of stakeholders in the assessment and improvement of educational programs at CF "UMC" is ensured by authorized bodies in the field of education and healthcare (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan), representatives of the public, professional organizations, as well as persons and structures responsible for postgraduate education:

1. Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan – independent evaluation of residents' knowledge.
2. Employers.
3. Representatives of the Committee for the Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Services and representatives of practical healthcare.

All stakeholders (teaching staff, residents, employers) are involved in the program evaluation process through representation in the relevant structures. The work of all structures ensuring the implementation and evaluation of the educational program is regulated by the University Charter, the strategic development plan of the university, annual plans and reports of the university.

#### **7.5 Procedure for approval of educational programs**

The educational organization has established a system for documenting the educational process, including approval of the educational program, which includes the following: State Compulsory Educational Standard, TC, WC and IEP.

The educational program is approved by the Educational and Methodological Council dated 04/27/2023 Protocol No. 5 based on criteria such as autopsy of a corpse, macro and microscopic examination of surgical and biopsy materials, cytological studies, execution of a pathological report, death certificates, etc., record keeping reporting documentation; participation in clinical and anatomical conferences, consultations. Participation of interested parties in approved educational programs is not reflected.

A system for monitoring the quality and compliance of clinical sites, material and technical equipment and educational resources has been developed and implemented in accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6.

The University has developed mechanisms for approving educational programs, providing for the evaluation of programs at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of implementation of EP and the progress of residents, and ensures the identification and timely resolution of emerging problems.

An examination of the EP is carried out for compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standards, the design documentation is approved according to the proposals of stakeholders and taking into account pre- and post-requisites, and the choice of methods for evaluating the learning outcomes of residents is assessed. A systematic study and comprehensive evaluation of the educational program is carried out in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the program, achieving goals, implementing tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of training methods), as well as assessing educational and methodological support and support of the educational process, assessment of the quality of the educational program. For this purpose, an external evaluation of the EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical healthcare.



*A survey of teachers showed that 68.75% confirmed that they are personally involved in the development of teaching materials for the residency program, partially 18.75%, 12.5% claim that they use ready-made ones.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): *fully – 10.*

**Recommendations for improvement:** *none*

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **8.1 Governance**

Residency training is carried out in accordance with the requirements of such regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents as the Rules for admission to residency of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre”. Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre” on March 1, 2018 No. 5 Changes and additions: 28 April 2023 No. 7. Evaluation of knowledge and skills is carried out on the basis of the “Instructions for the development of educational and methodological documentation and a system for assessing the educational achievements of resident doctors of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre”, Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation “university Medical Centre” “May 13” 2021 Protocol No. 2 (as amended from September 15, 2023, Protocol No. 15).

To implement the educational program in the educational organization, there is an organizational structure in which the educational sector is represented “Regulations on the Department of Education” Annex No. 7 to the minutes of the Board of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” August 01, 2023 No. 11 Approved by the decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” August 01, 2023 No. 11.

The experts reviewed the documents on completion of resident training, including the results of the Final Certification. The certificate of completion of residency is issued to residents based on the results of the Final Certification and contains information on the volume of completed disciplines, credits and hours, reflecting grades according to the point-rating system.

The quality assurance program for postgraduate education was developed “Rules for organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre”” and approved by decision of the Board of the corporate foundation “University Medical Centre” dated March 29, 2021 No. 6.

The program is known through the official website of the CF "UMC", the internal corporate mail of the CF "UMC", a WhatsApp group, on the Bitrix 24 intranet, which provides information on educational residency programs for applicants, a class schedule, an academic calendar, a catalogue of elective disciplines , syllabuses, etc., which ensures accessibility and transparency of the educational process.

### **8.2 Academic leadership**

The responsibility and liability of the management and employees for postgraduate medical education has been determined, which are assigned to the Deputy Chairman of the Board of the CF “UMC” Nurgul Kalieva Khamzina (order No. 04-n/k dated 02/07/2023 “On the distribution of duties, areas of authority and responsibility between members of the Board and other officials of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre"). Transparency of management and decision-making in the educational process is ensured by the discussion of educational and methodological documentation for the residency program at EMC meetings and, after receiving their positive conclusion, it is approved by the supervising head of the CF “UMC”. Based on the order of the Deputy Chairman of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated June 14, 2023 No. 09 -n/k, the composition of the EMC includes the Chairman represented by the Deputy Chairman of the Board, the Deputy Chairman of the EMC represented by the Director of the Department, 18 members from among the administrative and managerial staff of the CF

"UMC" and representatives of practical health care of 4 centres, as well as the secretary of the EMC.

The educational organization evaluates the leadership of the educational process and employees in relation to the achievement of the mission of the residency program, the expected final learning outcomes through feedback from residents and teachers (see section 7.2 of the report), certification based on the document, audits on issues of pedagogy, communication skills, teaching methods, knowledge of legal regulations, etc.

*To the question of the questionnaire "Do the heads of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical work," 84.38% of teachers answered that systematically, 9.38% answered "sometimes", 0% "quite rarely", 0% "never", no answer -6.25%.*

### **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The university budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for training personnel in university and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

Funding for the residency program depends on the formation of an annual government order. Every year, the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which the funding of bachelor's, master's, doctoral and residency programs is determined by type of educational institution.

The department responsible for planning and distribution of finances in residency programs is the responsibility of the first head of CF "UMC" - the Chairman of the Board. The financial and economic department under the leadership of the Managing Director for Finance is responsible for managing financial issues at CF "UMC" in accordance with Order No. 48-n/k dated May 24, 2018. The terms of reference, responsibility and authority are reflected in the job descriptions.

A financial plan is drawn up annually, including a target budget for training. The financial plan is consistent with the strategic plan. The share of funding for residency programs, taking into account the expansion of residency specialties, increased from 46,439,940.7 in 2021 to 109,963,106.39 in 2023. The most funds are spent on the purchase of books, the purchase of simulation equipment, resident doctors are sent to conferences, internships.

A financial report is provided annually, which is approved and demonstrates, among other things, the distribution of educational resources in accordance with needs and the covering of all types of expenses in 2023 (6 months) - 46,547,356.47 tenge for the implementation and development of the residency program.

### **8.4 Administration and management**

The University annually makes changes and additions to the organizational structure. The staffing schedule of departments/modules providing residency educational programs is approved annually, taking into account changes in the number of residents. According to Article 52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-SH, the total number of teaching staff is formed based on the average ratio of residents and teachers - 3:1.

There are an appropriate administrative (9 people) and teaching (206 people) staff, including management: 917.75. To effectively manage the educational process, employees of the Education Department have undergone advanced training.

An evaluation of the administration and management of the educational process in general and the residency educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is carried out and the results demonstrate such achievements as the acquisition of competencies by residents and employment upon graduation and good feedback from the employer.

### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The educational organization complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan

and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, in accordance with the classifier of residency specialties (On approval of the Classifier of areas of training for personnel with higher and postgraduate education Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569), in the organization of education at the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year. Each year, training is provided in 20 specialties and training in \_\_specialties is planned. All educational programs are provided with relevant educational and methodological documents and teachers.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Comply with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): *fully – 11.*

***Recommendations for improvement: none.***

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The procedure for updating the organizational structure is being carried out and in 2023 the following changes were made, educational programs for the residency of the CF “UMC” were included in the register, which is maintained in electronic format in the information system “Unified Platform for Higher Education” (UPHE) (<https://epvo.kz/>).

CF "UMC" always strives to respond in a timely manner to changing internal and external conditions. In order to continuously improve the educational process, in accordance with the best practices of global educational management, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare, the Republic of Kazakhstan, which is in the reform stage, regularly initiates a review and updating of processes.

Resident selection policies and resident selection and admission practices are adjusted annually to meet changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in basic medical education, and curriculum requirements.

The mentoring policy is updated annually to reflect changing needs in postgraduate education. A convincing example of the process of continuous improvement of approaches to the implementation of educational residency programs is the active participation of stakeholders in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the Institute’s social responsibility for the development of advanced innovative technologies in practical medicine and science, the use of advances in information and communication technologies, as well as the promotion of public health.

To develop organizational structure, governance and management to cope with the changing circumstances and needs of postgraduate training, and, over time, gathering the interests of various stakeholder groups.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Complies with 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 improvement standard): completely - 2.

***Recommendations for improvement: none***

**Conclusion:** While conducting an external assessment of the educational program, it was found that out of *114 standards* (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards), 111 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 80 basic standards and 31 improvement standards. There are partially met 2 basic standards and 1 improvement standard. No non-compliance with standards has been identified. Compliance with improvement standards indicates compliance of the educational organization with international consensus in such areas as education, clinic and science.

### **5. Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy”**

- 1) To actively apply PBL and CBL teaching methods in the educational process.
- 2) To develop syllabuses for each discipline (Standard 2.1.4).

- 3) The assessment of residents should be brought into line with the point-rating system (Standard 3.1.1).
- 4) To automate the assessment of the validity of test items (Standard 3.1.4).

#### 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01112 “Pathological Anatomy” with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairperson of EEC	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	
Foreign Expert	Ziganshina Liliya Yevgenevna	
Foreign Expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	
Academic Expert	Zhantelieva Lyazzat Asanovna	
Academic Expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	
Academic Expert	Idrisov Alisher Saugabaevich	
Academic Expert	Ramazanova Sholpan Khamzaevna	
Academic Expert	Dolmatova Irina Anatolyevna	
Academic Expert	Arinova Saule Pasevnoevna	
Academic Expert	Karibaeva Dina Orynbasarovna	
Academic Expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	
Academic Expert	Menchisheva Yulia Alexandrovna	
Resident Expert	Yerkinov Yerbolat	
Resident Expert	Orynbay Aizere Sauletkyzy	

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of an educational program  
(summarization)**

N <sup>o</sup> Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	BS*/SI	Grade		
				Totally coincides	Partially comply	Does not comply
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	14	9/5	14		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	22	19/2	21	1	
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES	9	4/3	7	2	
4.	TRAINEES	20	14/6	20		
5.	TRAINERS	8	7/1	8		
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	18	11/7	18		
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	10	7/3	10		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	11	8/3	11		
9.	CONTINIOUS RENEWAL	2	1/1	2		
	Total	114	80/31	113	3	

**List of documents studied by members of the EEC as part of an external evaluation of the residency educational program**

<b>№</b>	<b>Names of documents</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
1.	INSTRUCTIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL AND METHODOLOGICAL DOCUMENTATION AND A SYSTEM FOR EVALUATING THE ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENTS OF RESIDENT DOCTORS OF THE CORPORATE FOUNDATION "UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER" Approved by the decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" on May 13, 2021. Protocol No. 2 (as amended by 09/15/2023 Protocol No. 15)	1
2.	Rules for organizations of the educational process in the residency of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" Approved by the decision of the Board of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" dated March 29, 2021 No. 6	1
3.	Syllabuses, Working Curricula, Schedule, Job Descriptions of Resident Physicians, Privilege Sheets for all residency programs. Catalogue of elective disciplines for the 2023-2024 academic years. Academic calendar for 2023-2024 Approved by the Educational and Methodological Council on September 15, 2023. Protocol No. 15	1
4.	Educational program for all residency specialties. Approved by the Educational and Methodological Council on April 27, 2023 Protocol No. 5	1
5.	PROCEDURE FOR SELECTING AND SENDING RESIDENT DOCTORS OF THE CORPORATE FOUNDATION "UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER" FOR INTERNSHIP. Approved by the Educational and Methodological Council on September 15, 2023. Protocol No. 15	1
6.	Regulations on the Educational and Methodological Council of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" Regulations on the Educational and Methodological Council of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre"	1
7.	Rules for admission to the residency program of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre". Approved by the decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" on March 1, 2018 No. 5 Changes and additions: June 26, 2019 No. 14, March 5, 2021 No. 5, April 20, 2022 No. 5, April 28, 2023 No. 7	1
8.	Order on approval of academic staff and clinical mentors in the residency specialty of the corporate foundation "University Medical Centre" Order No. 29 z/k dated 09/22/2023	1
9.	REGULATIONS on the Department of Education Annex No. 7 to the minutes of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" August 01, 2023 No. 11 Approved by the decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" August 01, 2023 No. 11	1
10.	Agreement on the provision of paid services for conducting educational events under the "Residency" program of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" Agreement with the National Research and Educational Centre No. DO-2060 dated 11/08/2023	1
11.	Agreement on the provision of paid services for conducting educational events under the "Residency" program of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" NSCMC Agreement No. DO-2100 dated	1

	10/20/2023	
12.	Agreement on the provision of paid services for conducting educational events under the “Residency” program of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” Agreement NSCC No. DO-730 dated 08/30/2023	1
13.	Agreement on the provision of paid services for conducting educational events under the “Residency” program of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” Agreement with the MSI at the REM “City Phthisiopulmonology Centre” No. 994 dated 04/26/2023	1
14.	Agreement on the provision of paid services for conducting educational events under the “Residency” program of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” Agreement with the State Children's Hospital No. 3 from DES-180 dated 01/24/2023	1
15.	Agreement on the provision of paid services for conducting educational events under the “Residency” program of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” Agreement with City Hospital No.2 DES-DES-129 dated 01/19/2023	1
16.	REGULATIONS on the Department of Education Annex No. 7 to the minutes of the Board of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” August 01, 2023 No. 11 Approved by the decision of the Board of the Corporate Foundation “University Medical Centre” August 01, 2023 No. 11	1